than China. But, in China, so far as the underground output per man-shift is concerned, it is much higher than the Indian output per man-shift. I have got the figures from 1988-89. The output of both underground and open-cast has been increasing.

In NCCL as well as CIL, we don't want to have much higher production because if the coal is not dispatched in time, it may get destroyed by fire. Therefore, the production is determined according to the target fixed. But we are not satisfied with the total output and so far as underground production is concerned, we are trying to improve it.

श्री दिलीप सिंह जूदेव : सभापति महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहूंगा कि मध्य प्रदेश के छत्तीसगढ़ क्षेत्र में कुछ नई कोयले की खदानें खुली हैं। अभी माननीय सदस्य महोदय का प्रश्न था खदानों और उनके घाटे के बारे में, यह देखने को मिला है कि मध्य प्रदेश के जितने भी सीमावर्ती प्रान्त हैं जहां पर कोयले की खानें घाटे में चल रही हैं, वहां पर कुछ ऐसे गिरोह काम कर रहे हैं और वहां के लोगों को ला-ला कर हम लोगों के मध्य प्रदेश और छत्तीसगढ़ में उनकी भाजी कर रहे हैं। इसलिए वहां जो शिक्षित बेरोजगार लोग हैं उनकी रोज़ी रोटी मार खा रही है। मैं आपसे पूछना चाहूंगा कि इसे रोकने के लिए सरकार क्या-क्या उपाय कर रही है ?

SHRI AJIT KUMAR PANJA : Sir, this question relates to Bharat Coking Coal, Madhuban. But as far as Chattisgarh is concerned, since the hon. Member has shown interest, I will send him the information that he has asked for.

Fixing of Higher Growth Rate For Enhancing Economic Reforms

*265. SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Will the Minister of PLANNING AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION be pleased to state :

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to the Statement of the President, Indian Merchant's Chamber proposing that the economy should fix higher growth rate to increase the pace of economic reforms;

(b) if so, Government's comments thereon; and

(c) what were the targets and actual growth rates during 1992-93 ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION (SHRI GIRIDHAR GOMANGO) : (a) and (b) Yes Sir. The purpose of economic reforms is more efficient use of resources in the economy to realise higher growth. Growth targets have been fixed keeping in view these possibilities as also the pace of economic reforms.

(c) The targeted growth rate of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) on an average for the five year period during the Eighth Five Year Plan is 5.6 per cent. As per the advance estimates made by the Central Statistical Organisation (CSO), the growth in GDP in 1992-93 is likely to be about 4.2 per cent.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Sir, I am surprised that the Minister in his own reply is contradicting himself. From his own statistics, it should have been clear to him that the targets which he has mentioned are now not achievable any more. The Eighth Plan target for growth is 5.6% according to his own statement. First of all, it is said to be a high target. During the Seventh Plan, the average is 5.5%. During the Eighth Plan, the assumed growth rate is 5.6%. Two years are already over. In the current year, he says that it is 4.2% and in the last year I think it was 3-odd per cent. Assuming that to be so then for the next three years, you will have to have an average of 6.7% growth to achieve the average of 5.6%. But it is not possible. Everybody knows that 6.7% is not possible. I want to know from the Minister whether in view of the realities of the last two years, his Ministry or the Planning Commission has revised the target to bring a more realistic figure before the country so that we are not under a wrong impression that we can achieve anywhere near 5.6%.

SHRI GIRIDHAR GOMANGO : Sir, in my reply, I have not contradicted myself. What I said was that we have fixed 5.6% to be the growth rate for the Eighth Plan. We have done a realistic assessment under certain norms. On that basis only, we can give the figures. On the second point which the hon. Member has referred to, I said "likely to achieve 4.2%". But he is disputing that and I am not contradicting it because the question relates to why the Government is not proposing higher estimates for the Eighth Plan period. The question arises out of a statement made by the Chamber of Commerce. We cannot fix the growth rate either too low or too high on the basis of presumptions and assumptions. Yet, the hon. Member says we can do it. When we fixed the growth rate on the basis

of certain norms, we have to achieve them. We cannot overestimate or underestimate.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : What achievement is really . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : But the Minister has said that the Plan has fixed the target and that there is no way of increasing the target. If they can perform it, it is all right. They may overdo or overfulfil the target.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Fine, Sir. If the answer is that even in view of the two years' performance, they stick to their targets knowing that it is not achievable and don't want to revise it, it is all right.

Sir, my second supplementary is, what are the annual growth rates projected for the next three years ? From that, we will calculate whether the target is achievable or not. I hope Mr. Gomango will understand this. The past two years' performance makes the target impossible. The Government should come out with a White Paper, telling us what the difficulties are and revising the target downwards. We should not feel ashamed of what is happening. After all, it is not in your hands. I appreciate that it is a high target. In the last two years, the target has not been achieved. The low growth in the last two years is so much that in the next three years, you cannot make it up. Please tell us what the Government's thinking is. For the remaining three years of the Eighth Plan, what the country should look forward to is a realistic achievement during the Eighth Plan period.

SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SAMBHAJIRAO SHINDE : It should be related to inflation. At the same time, inflation is coming down.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : What Shri Shinde is saying has no relation to my question.

MR. CHAIRMAN : You ignore Mr. Shinde.

SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SAMBHAJIRAO SHINDE : It has a relation.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please allow the Minister to answer.

SHRI GIRIDHAR GOMANGO : Sir, for the first year of the Eighth Plan, the advance estimate is 4.2%. It is for the first year of the Eighth Five Year Plan. In the current year, i. e. 1993-94, the growth rate is expected to be still higher. Again, you are insisting on why the Government is not going to give a higher estimation figure. Sir, the Government can only give figures where the achievement will be nearer the estimated target and that they are realistic. Otherwise, it will be very difficult to achieve the target. So, I can only say that the Government has to come forward only with a realistic assessment.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Question Hour is over. Now, Papers to be laid on the Table.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Inclusion of Retired Employees in Pension Scheme

*261. SHRI N. GIRI PRASAD : Will the Minister of LABOUR be pleased to state :

(a) whether Government have received any representation from Textile Retired Labour Union and All India Bidi, Cigar and Tobacco Workers Federation, Gudiyattam, Tamil Nadu urging that the retired employees also be brought under the purview of the proposed Pension Scheme applicable to E. P. F. subscribers; and

(b) if so, what is the action proposed thereon ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF LABOUR (SHRI P. A. SANGMA) : (a) Yes, Sir.

(b) As the proposed Pension Scheme is of contributory nature, it is not possible to extend the scheme to all the subscribers who have retired in the past.

बाल श्रम जारी रखने के लिए भारत की भर्त्सना करने वाले देश

*266. श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी : क्या श्रम मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) क्या बाल श्रम को रोकने के लिए कुछ नई परियोजनाएं शुरू किये जाने का प्रस्ताव है;

(ख) यदि हां, तो उनका ब्यौरा क्या है;

(ग) दुनिया में किन देशों में भारत को यहां बच्चों से कराये जा रहे श्रम के लिए लताड़ा है; और

(घ) क्या इस वजह से कुछ देशों ने भारत से माल का आयात करने पर कोई रोक लगाने का निर्णय लिया है ?